



# The City of Grove City, Ohio

4035 Broadway • Grove City, Ohio 43123  
(614) 277-3000

Planning Commission Staff Report  
Council Chambers  
July 24, 2018 1:30pm

#### 4. APPLICATION: Beulah Park Apartments (Subarea H) | Development Plan

Project Number: 201806150023

Location: Located approximately 720 feet west of Broadway and 660 feet south of Southwest Boulevard (PID 040-004276, 040-004273, 040-004263, and 040-004271)

Proposal: A development plan for 376 apartments in 12 buildings and a clubhouse

Applicant: Donald Plank, Plank Law Firm LPA, 411 East Town Street, Floor 2, Columbus, Ohio 43215

#### Relevant Code Section(s):

- 1135.14 Zoning Districts and Regulations – Planned Unit Development District
- C-24-18 Beulah Park Zoning Text
- CR-49-17 Beulah Park Preliminary Development Plan
- CR-15-14 Beulah Park Conceptual Framework
- GroveCity2050 Community Plan – Future Land Use and Character Map
- GroveCity2050 Community Plan – Development and Conservation Strategy

#### Project Summary

The applicant is requesting approval of a development plan for Subarea H containing 376 apartments within 12 two to three story buildings and a separate clubhouse. Subarea H is located in the east portion of the Beulah Park site, just west of the railroad tracks and approximately 660 feet south of Southwest Boulevard. The proposed plan is in accordance with the approved Beulah Park zoning text in terms of use and density, which would permit a maximum of 415 units. The proposed development is to contain 39 fewer units than the maximum permits.



A total of 304 apartments are proposed with 206 units having one (1) bedroom and 98 having two (2) bedrooms. A total of 80 townhomes are proposed with 64 of those units having two (2) bedrooms and 16 being three (3) bedroom units.

City Council approved the preliminary development plan for Beulah Park in December 2017 under CR-49-17, and the rezoning for the site was approved in May 2018 under C-24-18. The proposed development for Subarea H meets the requirements of the zoning text approved as part of the rezoning application.

The site of the proposed development was identified as “Mixed Neighborhood” on the GroveCity2050 Community Plan Future Land Use and Character Map. This land use calls for a mix of housing types with the potential to incorporate small-scale, neighborhood-oriented retail or office uses. These districts are typically located within a walkable distance to a neighborhood activity center. The proposed development is in line with this future land use, as it offers a unique housing option within the Beulah Park development and for the larger community. The development will bring additional residents within walking distance of the historic Town Center, and contribute to the mixed-use environment designated for the area on the GroveCity2050 Development and Conservation Strategy. The proposed development is also in alignment with the five Redevelopment Principles of the Beulah Park Conceptual Framework, including an emphasis on quality design and connectivity within the development and to the larger network.

### Site Plan

The 24.08-acre site is proposed to have two 32’ curb cuts off of Street “A” of the Beulah Park public roadway network. Each entrance will be two-way with a landscape median in the center. Access drives throughout the site will be either 24’ or 22’ in width and be two-way. Most of the provided parking will be pull in spaces along the access drives or in garages located off of the access drives, with some parallel spaces also provided off private access drives. The applicant is proposing to utilize 18” straight curbing throughout the site.

A total of 376 apartments are proposed with of 304 traditional apartments and 80 townhomes. The overall density of the site is 15.61 dwelling units per acre which is within the permitted density as noted in the approved zoning text.

A total of 12 multi-story apartment and townhouse buildings are proposed throughout the site and will vary in size with the larger buildings proposed to have 32 to 48 units each and the smaller buildings proposed to have 16 to 24 units each. There are 10 proposed garage structures located throughout the site, ranging from six (6) to nine (9) spaces available within them. The proposed clubhouse will be located on the west side of the site near the southern entrance and will also have a pool and a mail kiosk located nearby. In addition to the clubhouse and pool, other site amenities include a variety of open space, tot lot, and dog park.



Sidewalks will be provided throughout the site, on both sides of most private drives. The sidewalks on site will connect with sidewalks along Street "A" to connect with the larger sidewalk network through Beulah Park to provide pedestrian circulation in the area.

Based on the number of units proposed, 16.8 acres of open space is required for the subarea. Although only 2.39 acres of open space is provided on the proposed plans, in the tot lot, dog park, and clubhouse areas, when taking in the larger context of the development into consideration, which includes a large central open space, it offsets the deficiencies within the individual subareas.

Two (2) stormwater detention ponds are located in the site, with one in the southern portion of the site, and the second in the northern portion of the site. In order to make the southern pond more of an amenity to residents, a path should be installed around it, or at minimum sidewalks be installed along the parking areas and drives adjacent to the pond.

### Landscaping

A landscape plan was provided showing different landscaping around the site and buildings as well as an existing tree inventory showing approximately 400 trees to be preserved in the large tree stand at the northeast portion of the site. Although a tree inventory was submitted and plans show this tree stand as remaining, a tree preservation plan was not submitted showing how the trees will be preserved (signage, specific boundaries of preservation, etc.). This will need to be completed with the engineering / site improvement plan.

Entry features are proposed to have a combination of evergreen shrubs and other plantings along both sides of each entrance and landscape median. Stone columns will also be provided along each entrance with 4' white vinyl cross buck fencing, matching features proposed throughout Beulah Park. Areas along Street "A" are proposed to be sodded and lined with the stone columns and cross buck fencing as well.

The clubhouse and pool will be landscaped with four (4) different types of ornamental trees, nine (9) types of shrubs, and a combination of other plantings.

Norway Spruce trees are proposed on the outside of the 6' vinyl fencing to further screen parcel 040-004268 from the buildings, with the entire western property line being screened and portions of the southern. While staff is supportive of the proposed screening, additional trees should be provided along the southern property line to more fully screen that property line, particularly with the majority of the buildings being visible from that area.

Screening is proposed along the eastern property line to buffer from the railroad tracks and along the northern property line. Plantings in these areas include evergreen trees, Autumn Blaze Maple trees, and Wright Brothers Sugar Maple trees. While staff is supportive of these plantings, the screening along the eastern property line is blocked by a proposed 6' white vinyl fence. The location of this fence needs to be reversed to be to the east of the plantings.

Some landscaping is provided around each building, but additional shrubs and perennials are needed to meet the plantings requirements around buildings 6, 7, 8, 10, 11, and 12. Additionally, a fence is proposed around the a/c units, but landscaping is not provided and is needed to meet screening of service structures requirement.

Landscaping is proposed around the pond in the southern portion of the site, including American Yellowwood and American Dream Oak trees, and some evergreen trees. A couple small landscape beds are also proposed. More landscaping is needed for this pond to comply with standard drawing C-GC-98, including needing 20% of the pond's bank having landscaping beds.

## Buildings

Five (5) different building types have been submitted for the proposed apartments and townhouses, with each containing different unit types. The largest buildings will have 48 units, contain all apartments, and be three-stories in height at approximately 137,000 square feet in size each. The smallest buildings will contain 16 units with a combination of apartments and townhouses and be two-stories in height at approximately 33,000 square feet in size. Some unit types including the townhouse buildings are proposed to utilize pitched roofs (with “Mission Brown” asphalt shingles) and be located further east on the site away from the streets with attached garages on the sides. The all apartment buildings are proposed to utilize flat roofs and be closer to or along Street “A” to provide a more urban look to the Subarea. Each building is proposed to utilize brick veneer (Triangle Brick “Bessemer Grey”) along the first and portions of the second story with vertical board and batten vinyl siding and horizontal vinyl lap (Odyssey Plus “Tuscan Clay”, “Vintage Wicker”, and “Monterey Sand”) siding used on the upper portions and around any proposed attached garages. Each building will provide balconies proposed with aluminum railings and beige or cream wood framing.



Two (2) different designs for detached garages have been submitted, but both are proposed to utilize the same materials and colors found on the proposed apartment buildings. Any garage visible from Street “A” will be finished primarily in brick veneer, and garages not visible from the street will be finished in brown horizontal vinyl lap siding. Both garages will have pitched roofs with “Mission Brown” asphalt shingles, and both will have the same style and color of light brown garage doors.

The proposed clubhouse, as with the other buildings, will be finished in the same materials utilizing brick veneer around the northern portion of the building with horizontal vinyl lap siding around the remainder of the building. The northern portion is proposed to have a pitched roof with the remainder of the building having a flat roof. A stone wall is proposed around the building as well. Aluminum framed and glass

overhead doors will be provided around the clubhouse that can be opened and lead out to the community pool and outdoor seating areas.



Service buildings and the pool pavilion will be finished in a brick watertable with brick veneer on the remaining walls and a pitched roof with “Mission Brown” asphalt shingles. The mail pavilion will be finished in a brick veneer watertable and horizontal vinyl siding utilized on the remaining walls, and the same type of pitched roof as the other service buildings.

Gates at the entrances to the site will utilize manufactured stone veneer walls, the same type of stone proposed around the clubhouse, with a white cast stone or cut stone cap and white steel gates.

The dog park is proposed to be fenced with a four (4) foot white “cross buck” vinyl fence with black vinyl coated wire mesh around the fences interior.

A six (6) foot white vinyl fence is proposed along the east and south property line of parcel 040-004268 and along the eastern property line to buffer the site from the railroad tracks. While staff is supportive of the fencing, the proposed fencing along the eastern property line is on the outside of the proposed landscaping, and staff is not supportive of this layout and believes that the fence should be located on the east side of the plantings.

The trash compactor is proposed to be enclosed with a white vinyl fence. Staff is not supportive of service structures being screened with vinyl fencing, and would instead be supportive of utilizing brick veneer walls, matching that used on the buildings with stained 100% opaque wood gates.

### Parking

A total of 660 parking spaces are proposed throughout the site, providing approximately 1.75 spaces per unit or 1.14 spaces per bedroom. Most of the spaces (581 spaces) will be uncovered and 79 of the spaces will be covered, within the proposed attached and detached garages. Parking spaces will range in size from nine (9) feet by 18 feet for standard spaces to parallel spaces proposed to be nine (9) feet by 20 feet. The plans also state that all parking lot striping and pavement markings will be white.

### Lighting

The site lighting fixtures are proposed to be LED, black, and decorative (“New Orleans II HT”), utilizing a similar style to the lamplighter lighting fixtures found in Town Center.

### Signage

One (1) sign is proposed in front of the clubhouse along Street “A”. The proposed monument sign will have a manufactured stone veneer base matching and connecting to the proposed stone veneer wall around the clubhouse. The sign will be approximately 26.6 square feet in size and have black lettering stating “Beulah Park Apartments” with a beige background. The Beulah Park zoning text states that

entry/monument signage is to be approved as part of the final development plan, and staff is supportive of the proposed sign.

### **Analysis**

Per Section 1135.14 of the Codified Ordinances of Grove City, Planning Commission is charged with reviewing and evaluating Preliminary and Final Development Plan applications by applying the eight (8) findings.

- (1) The uses proposed will not be detrimental to present and potential surrounding uses, but will have a beneficial effect which could not be achieved under any other district.**

**Finding is Met:** The proposed multi-family development meets the requirements of the approved Beulah Park Zoning Text. The Beulah Park Conceptual Framework calls for quality design for an attractive public and private realm. This proposed development will create that quality development through the proposed materials on the building and the proposed amenities on the site including the clubhouse and pool, tot lot, dog park, and sidewalks that will connect to the greater Beulah Park path network.

- (2) Any exception from Zoning Code (Ordinance C79-74, passed January 20, 1975) requirements is warranted by the design and amenities incorporated in the Development Plan.**

**Finding is Met:** A number of exceptions from Code are proposed with this development including the standard parking space size and amount of proposed open space; however, staff believes that the proposed deviations are appropriate for the development given the intended urban character of the site and the additional open space and amenities that will be available to residents of the subarea as part of the larger Beulah Park development. Additionally, the proposed development meets the requirements for the subarea in the approved Beulah Park zoning text.

- (3) Land surrounding the proposed development can be planned in coordination with the proposed development and that it is compatible in use.**

**Finding is Met:** The proposed apartments and townhomes meet the quality of design intended for the area by utilizing both an urban and suburban design of the buildings, used in other recent apartment projects. Additionally, the site is part of the larger Beulah Park development and master planned PUD, and will connect with the area via proposed roadway, sidewalk and trail network. The Beulah Park Conceptual Framework calls for greater connectivity, and with the proposed sidewalks and multiple points of access, the proposed site layout meets that expectation.

- (4) The proposed change to a Planned Unit Development District is in conformance with the general use intent of the area.**

**Finding is Met:** The proposed multi-family development is in conformance with the Beulah Park zoning text and is proposing less density and units than Subarea H was approved for with the rezoning, providing less of an impact on the surrounding area. Additionally, the design of the buildings meets the quality of development that staff has intended for the Beulah Park site. Furthermore, the Beulah Park Conceptual Framework recommended that greater connectivity and quality design be provided. The proposed sidewalks and roadways on the site will provide multiple connectivity points for both vehicular and pedestrian access. With the recreational amenities on the site, such as the pool, tot lot, and dog park, staff believes that the quality of design the Framework calls for has been met, as well.

- (5) Existing and proposed streets are suitable and adequate to carry anticipated traffic within the proposed district and in the vicinity of the proposed district.**

**Finding is Met:** The site will have two entrances/exits onto Street "A" which is proposed to have an access onto both Southwest Blvd and Broadway, providing multiple points of access to and from this site. Additionally, Street "A" will connect with another proposed street that will have an access point onto Demorest Road, providing a third access point.

- (6) Existing and proposed utility services are adequate for the proposed development.**

**Finding is Met:** The existing and proposed utility services are adequate for the proposed development. A more detailed review of the utilities will be conducted with the engineer / site improvement plan.

- (7) Each phase of the proposed development, as it is proposed to be completed contains the required parking spaces, landscape and utility areas necessary for creating and sustaining a desirable and stable environment.**

**Finding is Met:** The proposed development is proposed to be developed in a single phase and has been designed to contain the parking, landscaping and utilities to create a desirable environment.

- (8) The proposed Planned Unit Development District and all proposed buildings, parking spaces and landscape and utility areas can be completely developed within seven years of the establishment of the district, unless otherwise provided for by Council.**

**Finding is Met:** The proposed project, including building, parking spaces, landscaping and utilities can be completely developed within seven years.

### **GroveCity2050 Guiding Principles Analysis**

The City of Grove City adopted the GroveCity2050 Community Plan in January 2018 which contains specific goals, objectives and actions to guide growth in the community. Five (5) guiding principles are identified that articulate Grove City's community values and direct the recommendations in the Plan. Applications submitted to Planning Commission are reviewed based on these 5 Guiding Principles:

- (1) The City's small town character is preserved while continuing to bring additional employment opportunities, residents and amenities to the community.**

**Finding is Met:** The proposed site design utilizes both an urban design similar to that found in Town Center along the primary roadway and transitions internally to a more suburban design as the development nears existing residential areas to the east. Additionally, the site will provide 2.39 acres of open space for residents, adding to the amenity space in the proposed central open space approved as part of the rezoning of Beulah Park.

- (2) Quality design is emphasized for all uses to create an attractive and distinctive public and private realm.**

**Finding is Met:** Staff believes that the building materials stated in the text and shown on the provided renderings, including brick, stone, vinyl, and others, will create an attractive and quality development, as well as the proposed site layout with landscaping. Additionally, the amenities provided on the site including the clubhouse, pool, tot lot, dog park, and sidewalks will create a quality public realm for the subarea's residents.

- (3) Places will be connected to improve the function of the street network and create safe**

**opportunities to walk, bike and access public transportation throughout the community.**

**Finding is Met:** This site will provide two vehicular access points to safely enter and exit the site. Furthermore, the site will provide sidewalks throughout that will connect with the proposed Beulah Park sidewalk and trail network.

- (4) Future development that will preserve, protect and enhance the City's natural and built character through sustainable practices, prioritizing parks and open space and emphasizing historic preservation.**

**Finding is Met:** The site will provide an additional 2.39 acres of open space that will be used for recreational amenities for residents and stormwater detention.

- (5) Development provides the City with a net fiscal benefit.**

**Finding is Met:** Residential land uses do not generally provide the City a fiscal benefit, as revenue primarily comes from income tax from workers employed within the City; however, the increase in property value from the quality development of the site will be an overall benefit to the community.

### **Recommendation**

The Development Department recommends Planning Commission make a recommendation of approval to City Council for the Development Plan with the following stipulations.

1. All entry features shall be irrigated per Section 1136.09(a)(1).
2. The southern property line of parcel 040-004268 shall be fully screened with the line of evergreen trees going along the entire property line.
3. Landscaping around each residential building shall meet the requirements of Section 1136.09(a)(1) and/or the approval of the Urban Forester.
4. All parking lot peninsulas shall have one (1) two-inch caliper tree, unless restricted by underground utilities.
5. All service structures on site shall be landscaped per Section 1136.08, including the trash compactor, a/c units, and other service structures.
6. The trash compactor shall be enclosed with brick or brick veneer walls matching the brick utilized on the buildings and stained 100% opaque wood gates.
7. A path and additional landscaping shall be provided around the detention pond just east from the clubhouse and meet standard drawing C-GC-98.
8. The proposed 6' white vinyl fencing shall be placed to the east of the proposed landscaping along the eastern property line to buffer the site from the railroad tracks.